

Indicators of integration policy beneficiaries

Main topic	Indicators	Disaggregations currently possible with available data
1. Labour Market Mobility	Real: Uptake of Education and training	CoC (<i>Country of Citizenship</i>): -age - educational attainment - gender
	Potential: Uptake of out-of-work maintenance among unemployed	CoC: -age - educational attainment - gender
	Potential: NEET (Not in employment, education and training)	CoC: -age - educational attainment - gender
2. Family Reunion	Real: Annual number of TCN arriving with permit for family reunion with TCN	CoC: -citizenship of sponsor
	Potential: Separated couples	CoC:
3. Education	Real: Share of low-achievers in out-of-school literacy classes	CoB (<i>Country of Birth</i>): -1 st generation -2 nd generation
	Potential: Share of 15 year olds who have an immigrant background	CoB/CoC: -1 st generation -2 nd generation
4. Political Participation	Real: Enfranchised immigrants	CoB/CoC:
	Potential: Dis-enfranchised immigrants	CoC:
5. Permanent Residence	Real: Number of Permanent residents	CoC:
	Potential: TCN eligible for permanent residents (5 years residence)	CoC: - gender
6. Access to nationality	Real: Annual number of naturalised TCN	former citizenship: - gender
	Potential: TCN eligible for naturalisation	CoB/CoC: -1 st generation -2 nd generation
7. Anti-Discrimination	Indicator 12: Number of discrimination complaints	Grounds: -Race/Ethnicity -Religion/Belief
	Indicator 12: % perceiving discrimination	

1. Labour market mobility

- Uptake of Education and Training

Definition: Uptake of education and training is calculated by dividing the number of persons aged 20 to 64 in education and training by the total same age population. Uptake of education and training consists of those persons who stated that they received education or training in the four weeks preceding the survey. This variable is derived from two other variables: 'participation in regular education' and 'participation in other taught activities'; self-learning activities are no longer covered.

This indicator is calculated for the third country national population. We calculate uptake of education and training rates for low-educated (ISCED 0-2) and high-educated (ISCED 5-6) separately. The classification of educational attainment is based on the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED). Low-educated include all individuals who have completed pre-primary (ISCED 0), primary (ISCED 1) or lower secondary education (ISCED 2). All individuals who have completed tertiary education make up the high-educated population (ISCED 5-6).

Share receiving Education and training low-educated (ISCED 0-2) =
$$\frac{\text{Number of low-educated TCN in education and training in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total low-educated TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Share receiving Education and training high-educated (ISCED 5-6) =
$$\frac{\text{Number of high-educated TCN in education and training in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total high-educated TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Share receiving Education and training low-educated (ISCED 0-2) males=
$$\frac{\text{Number of low-educated TCN males in education and training in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total low-educated TCN male population in year X in country Z}}$$

Share receiving Education and training high-educated (ISCED 5-6) males=
$$\frac{\text{Number of high-educated TCN males in education and training in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total high-educated TCN male population in year X in country Z}}$$

Share receiving Education and training low-educated (ISCED 0-2) females=
$$\frac{\text{Number of low-educated TCN females in education and training in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total low-educated TCN female population in year X in country Z}}$$

Share receiving Education and training high-educated (ISCED 5-6) females=
$$\frac{\text{Number of high-educated TNC females in education and training year X in country Z}}{\text{Total high-educated TCN female population in year X in country Z}}$$

Source: Eurostat- EU Labour Force Survey

Explanation: Education and training encompasses all purposeful learning activity, whether formal or non-formal undertaken on an ongoing basis with the aim of improving knowledge, skills and competence. Within the domain of education and training statistics, formal education corresponds to education and training in the regular system of schools, universities, colleges and other formal educational institutions that normally constitute a continuous 'ladder' of full-time education for children and young people (generally completed by the age of 25). Non-formal education and training is defined as any organised and sustained educational activities that do not correspond to the definition of formal education. Non-formal education and training may or may not take place in educational institutions and cater to persons of all ages. It may

cover educational programmes to impart adult literacy, basic education for out-of-school children, life skills, work skills, and general culture. Note that the statistics presented do not cover informal learning, which corresponds to self-learning (through the use of printed material, computer-based learning/training, (internet) web-based education, visiting libraries, etc.).

Relevance: In June 2010, the European Commission presented a ten year vision for the future of vocational education and training in a Communication titled 'A new impetus for European cooperation in vocational education and training to support the Europe 2020 strategy' (COM(2010) 296 final). The integrated economic and employment guidelines were revised as part of the Europe 2020 strategy. Guideline 8 concerns developing a skilled workforce responding to labour market needs, and promoting job quality and lifelong learning. In line with this, through the strategic framework for education and training, Member States have identified four common objectives to address by 2020 and making lifelong learning a reality is one of them. The relevant ET2020 benchmark is to have at least 15% of adults participating in lifelong learning.

- **Uptake of unemployment benefits among unemployed**

Definition: Recipients of unemployment benefits is calculated as a share of the unemployed TCN population (aged 20 to 64) who report to be receiving out-of-work maintenance and support among the total unemployed TCN population. An individual is considered as having a particular activity status if he/she has spent more than half of the reference year in that status.

We calculate the share receiving unemployment benefits among the low-educated (ISCED 0-2) and high-educated (ISCED 5-6) separately. The classification of educational attainment is based on the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED). Low-educated include all individuals who have completed pre-primary (ISCED 0), primary (ISCED 1) or lower secondary education (ISCED 2). All individuals who have completed tertiary education make up the high-educated population (ISCED 5-6).

Share of unemployed low-educated (ISCED 0-2) receiving unemployment benefits =

$$\frac{\text{Number of unemployed low-educated TCN receiving unemployment benefits in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total low-educated TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Share of unemployed high-educated (ISCED 5-6) receiving unemployment benefits =

$$\frac{\text{Number of unemployed high-educated TCN receiving unemployment benefits in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total unemployed high-educated TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Source: Eurostat- EU Survey on Income and Living Conditions.

Explanation: Unemployment benefits refer to benefits that replace in whole or in part income lost by a worker due to the loss of gainful employment, provide a subsistence (or better) income to persons entering or re-entering the labour market, compensate for the loss of earnings due to partial unemployment, replace in whole or in part income lost by an older worker who retires from gainful employment before the legal retirement age because of job reductions for economic reasons, contribute to the cost of training or re-training people looking for employment, or help unemployed persons meet the cost of travelling or relocating to obtain employment.

It includes: full unemployment benefits, partial unemployment benefits, early retirement for labour-market reasons, vocational training allowance, mobility and resettlement, severance and termination payments, redundancy compensation, other cash benefits.

- **NEET – TCN population neither in employment nor in education or training**

Definition: This indicator presents the share of the TCN (aged 20-64) who are not in employment (i.e. unemployed or inactive according to the International Labour Organisation definition) nor in education or training. This indicator is calculated for low-educated (ISCED 0-2) TCN and high-educated (ISCED 5-6) TCN separately.

Share of low-educated (ISCED 0-2) TCN not in employment, education or training =

$$\frac{\text{Number of low-educated TCN not in employment, education or training in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total low-educated TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Share of high-educated (ISCED 5-6) TCN receiving unemployment benefits =

$$\frac{\text{Number of high-educated TCN not in employment, education or training in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total high-educated TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Source: Eurostat- Labour Force survey (EU-LFS)

Eurostat provides NEET rate data disaggregated by

- 1) Age and sex (%) [edat_lfse_20]
- 2) educational attainment level, age group and sex (%) [edat_lfse_21]

Explanation: The indicator on TCN neither in employment nor in education or training (NEET) corresponds to the percentage of the population of a given age group, sex and educational attainment who are employed and not involved in further education or training. The numerator of the indicator refers to persons who meet the following two conditions: (a) they are not employed (i.e. unemployed or inactive according to the International Labour Organisation definition) and (b) they have not received any education or training in the four weeks preceding the survey. The denominator in the total population consists of the same age group and sex, excluding the respondents who have not answered the question 'participation in regular (formal) education and training'.

Within the domain of education and training statistics, formal education corresponds to education and training in the regular system of schools, universities, colleges and other formal educational institutions that normally constitute a continuous 'ladder' of full-time education for children and young people (generally completed by the age of 25). Non-formal education and training is defined as any organised and sustained educational activities that do not correspond to the definition of formal education. Non-formal education and training may or may not take place in educational institutions and cater to persons of all ages. It may cover educational programmes to impart adult literacy, basic education for out-of-school children, life skills, work skills, and general culture.

2. Family reunion

- **Annual number granted a permit for family reunion with a TCN**

Definition: The number of successful applicants reuniting with non-EU nationals

This indicator exclusively captures all first time residence permits issued on the grounds of family reunification joining a non EU citizen.

Annual family reunion= Number granted residence permit for reunion with a TCN

Source: Eurostat- Migration Statistics

Eurostat provides first residence permits issued for family reasons data disaggregated by

1. Reason, length of validity and citizenship [migr_resfam]
2. Reason, age, sex and citizenship [migr_resfas]

Explanation: Family migration depends on a relationship with a sponsor with rights to residence in the destination country. The principle relationships recognised by family migration are spouses, minor-age children and other. This indicator only includes the immigrant group of our interest (non-EU) instead of all family reunification within a given Member State.

These statistics are collected by Eurostat on an annual basis. Data are entirely based on administrative sources with the exception of the United Kingdom and are provided mainly by the Ministries of Interior or related Immigration Agencies. Data are generally disseminated in June and July in the year following the reference year.

Relevance: The right to family and family life is enshrined in European and international law. EU Family Reunion Directive 2003/86/EC (ref) goes one step further to protect the right to family life by establishing the right to family reunion for non-EU sponsors and their families. Non-EU family reunion rate analyses whether countries promote the right to family reunion as a means to promote integration (Preamble 4 to Directive 2003/86/EC).

- **Separated TCN Couples**

Definition: Third country nationals who arrived ages 17+ and are married and not living in the same household as their partner.

Annual family reunion= Number of TCN who arrived aged 17+ who report to be married but not cohabiting with partner

Source: EU-LFS

Key variables

- 1) Marital status is defined by the variable [MARSTAT]
- 2) The family nucleus is reconstituted using variable [HHSPOU]

Explanation: This indicator sets out to estimate who are the 'potential' beneficiaries of family reunification policies, meaning that we want to identify adults who are married but whose spouse lives abroad. This category of spouse are the target group that can 'sponsor' their spouse for family reunification.

LFS allows us to identify people who are married but whose spouse does not live with them, based on two LFS variables. While this is an approximation as, as there is no additional information available on whether their spouse is abroad or what is their spouse's nationality, this is a first attempt to quantify those who could benefit from family reunification policies.

3. Education

- **Share of low-achievers in reading attending out-of-school time literacy classes**

Definition: The number of 1st generation and 2nd generation immigrants who do not attain literacy proficiency Level 2 who attend out-of-school time remedial literacy classes (anywhere in between <2 hours to >6).

1st generation low-achievers in out-of-school time classes=

$$\frac{\text{Number of foreign-born (age 15) who do not attain literacy proficiency Level 2 attending out of school classes}}{\text{Total foreign-born population (15) who do not attain literacy level 2}}$$

2nd generation low-achievers in out-of-school time classes=

$$\frac{\text{Number of 2nd generation (age 15) who do not attain literacy proficiency Level 2 attending out of school classes}}{\text{Total 2nd generation immigrant population (15) who do not attain literacy level 2}}$$

Source: OECD's Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)

The available data allows us to make a distinction between immigrants, native born children of immigrants and children of native born.

Explanation: In order to focus my analysis on low-achievers, a filter was created to include those who fell in the proficiency level categories "below level 1", "level 1b" and "level 1a". To identify those in out-of-school time language classes a dummy-variable was created from the variable that captured out-of-school language classes in the test language (ST55Q01). Answer category "1" was coded as 0 and all the rest were "1" (remedial).

The Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) covers students who are aged between 15 years 3 months and 16 years 2 months at the time of assessment and who have completed at least 6 years of formal schooling, regardless of the type of institution in which they are enrolled and of whether they are in full-time or part-time education, of whether they attend academic or vocational programmes, and of whether they attend public or private schools or foreign schools within the country. PISA scores give objective and comparable measures of educational achievement useful for the study of integration of migrant children across countries and is often used in research (OECD indicator of immigrant integration & Zaragoza integration indicator). This measure does not focus on actual access to different educational levels, instead it focuses on the quality of education which should result in higher achievement.

- **Share of 15 year olds who have an immigrant background**

Definition: The share of 15 year olds who are (i) non-EU foreign-born and (ii) native-born offspring of non-EU foreign-born

$$\text{1st generation immigrants= } \frac{\text{Number of TCN-born aged 15}}{\text{Total population aged 15}}$$

$$\text{2nd generation immigrants= } \frac{\text{Number of children of TCN-born aged 15}}{\text{Total population aged 15}}$$

Source: OECD's Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)

4. Political Participation

- **Enfranchised - Share of non-EU born who are naturalised**

Definition: This indicator represents the share of non-EU foreign-born 18+ who are enfranchised through naturalisation.

$$\% \text{ of non-EU foreign-born who have naturalised} = \frac{\text{Number of non-EU foreign-born 18+ who are also nationals for their country of residence}}{\text{Total non-EU foreign-born 18+ population}}$$

Source: EU-LFS

- **Enfranchised - Share of non-EU born TCN who acquire eligibility to practice TCN voting rights**

Definition: This indicator represents the share of non-EU foreign-born 18+ TCN population who meet national conditions thereby acquiring eligibility to use voting rights. Country specific requirements apply.

$$\% \text{ non-EU born TCN 18+ enfranchised} = \frac{\text{All non-EU born TCN 18+ meeting residence and/or permit requirements to use TCN voting rights}}{\text{Total non-EU foreign-born TCN 18+ population}}$$

Source: EU-LFS

Explanation: Countries differ in terms of the conditions that must be fulfilled to acquire voting rights. In order to calculate the TCN population who meet the national conditions acquiring eligibility we need to identify the unique requirements for each Member State. To calculate the enfranchised population in each country we first have to identify the fraction of the adult population that is entitled to vote as a result of fulfilling all requirements (e.g. length of permanent residence and permit status: see Table 1 in Appendix 2). With this information we can design the closest proxy measure to the countries' legal requirements.

Relevance: The European Parliament and the EU Commission have generally promoted an extension of voting rights to third country nationals but have also argued that imposing it on Member States would fall outside Community competences as defined in the European Treaties. For instance, the Common Basic Principles for Immigrant Integration in the EU adopted by the Justice and Home Affairs Council in 2004 state that "the participation of immigrants in the democratic process and in the formulation of integration policies and measures, especially at the local level, supports their integration". More specifically, the European Parliament has advocated voting rights for third country residents for local and EP elections since 1996. When countries do extend voting rights to non-citizens however, acquiring these rights are often restricted or limited in some ways, with the details of the restrictions or limitations varying from one country to another. The extension of electoral rights can be conditioned by (a) durational residency requirements and (b) specific legal residence status

- **Dis-enfranchised**

Definition: This indicator represents the share of non-EU foreign-born 18+ TCN population who do not meet national conditions to practice local voting rights. Country specific requirements apply.

$$\% \text{ non-EU born TCN 18+ dis-enfranchised} = \frac{\text{All non-EU born TCN 18+ who do not meet national voting requirements}}{\text{Total non-EU foreign-born TCN 18+ population}}$$

5. Permanent residence

- **Total number of Permanent residents**

Definition: The number of third country nationals residing in each EU Member State on the grounds of a valid permanent/long-term residence permit at the end of reference period.

TCN holding valid LTR permits = Number of TCN holding LTR permits in year X in country Z

Source: Eurostat- Migration Statistics

Eurostat provides permanent/long-term residence permit data disaggregated by

1. Citizenship on 31 December of each year [migr_reslong]
2. age, sex and citizenship on 31 December of each year [migr_reslas]

For the following countries National data sources were used to calculate the rate: **DE, FR, HR, PL, PT, FI, SE**

Explanation: The indicator “Long-term by citizenship on 31. December of each year” contains two categories of such permissions. EU long-term resident status refers to permits issued under Council Directive 2003/109/EC. This is based on a total duration of legal residence of 5 years or longer, combined with a series of other conditions that must be met to qualify for this status. National long-term resident status (This category includes Permanent resident status granted to third-country nationals under rules which are different from Council Directive 2003/109/EC). The United Kingdom, Ireland and Denmark have special arrangements for immigration and asylum policy, and the Directive on long-term resident status does not therefore apply in these countries.

Relevance: The integration of non-EU nationals who are long-term residents in the EU Members States is key to promoting economic and social cohesion in the EU. A non-EU national who has legally resided in an EU State for a certain period of time should thus be granted a set of uniform rights, almost identical to those enjoyed by EU citizens. Permanent residents enjoy the same treatment and rights as nationals in terms of access to employment and self-employment activity, education and vocational training, social protection and assistance (at least core benefits) and in terms of access to goods and services.

- **TCN eligible for Permanent residence permit**

Definition: Share of those with 5+ residence

TCN eligible for LTR=
$$\frac{\text{TCN with 5 years residence}}{\text{Total TCN population}}$$

Source: EU-LFS

Explanation: The years of residence should be calculated taking as starting point the year in which the person **last** established his or her usual residence in the country (or, in other words, when the person last moved to the country in order to live there). In case of an interruption in the period of residence, the starting point should be the end of this interruption only if the length of this interruption was at least one year.

Relevance: The main criterion for acquiring the status of long-term resident is the duration of residence” in the receiving country. The share of TCN with 5 years’ residence in comparison to the number of TCN holding a valid LTR permit could reflect the existence of policies restricting access to long-term residents by excluding, discouraging, or delaying many well-settled TCN from applying.

6. Access to nationality

- **Annual number of naturalised TCN**

Definition: Grants of citizenship awarded by the reporting country to persons who were previously citizens of a non-EU country

Annual number of naturalised TCN = All TCN granted Member State citizenship in country x in year z

Eurostat provides citizenship acquisition data disaggregated by

1. sex, age group and former citizenship [migr_acq]

Explanation: "Citizenship" means the particular legal bond between an individual and his or her State, acquired by birth or naturalisation. Naturalisation is one of the most common ways to acquire a new citizenship. It is a formal act of granting citizenship to an alien, upon application. International law does not provide detailed rules for naturalisation, but recognizes the competence of every State to naturalise non-nationals, who apply to become its citizens. Naturalisation is the process of acquisition where a person *applies* for citizenship to the state represented by relevant public authorities. This emphasis on the aspiring citizen's process of application is key in distinguishing naturalisation from other procedures.

- **Non-naturalised TCN eligible for naturalisation by generational status**

Definition: 1st and 2nd generation TCN who meet the minimum residence requirements for naturalisation. Country specific requirements apply.

Source: Eurostat – EU Labour Force Survey

Eurostat provides data on years of residence [YEARESID]

Explanation: All countries have a minimum residence requirement for acquisition of citizenship through ordinary naturalisation. However, there is significant variation with respect to the duration of that residency period, the extent to which interruptions are tolerated and whether the applicant needs to hold a certain residence status or permit at the time of application or even throughout the required residence period. For countries which may require a specific residence status/permit as a pre-requisite for naturalisation the years of residence required to obtain this status are also taken into account in our country specific definitions (see Appendix 2).

The years of residence should be calculated taking as starting point the year in which the person **last** established his or her usual residence in the country (or, in other words, when the person last moved to the country in order to live there). In case of an interruption in the period of residence, the starting point should be the end of this interruption only if the length of this interruption was at least one year.

Relevance: Although there may be several reasons for an individual who meets the core requirements for naturalisation not to have done so, inaccessibility may be one of them. Many countries see the rationale behind rigorous requirements as a measure to improve the integration of society's newest members, by ensure that new members of society have the tools needed to succeed. At the same time, unintended effects can arise when would-be citizens are required to clear higher hurdles as part of the naturalisation process. When the requirements to achieve citizenship are set too high the citizenship process can become counterproductive, interfering with the very integration it seeks to promote.

7. Anti-discrimination

- **Reports of discrimination reported at the National Equality Body**

Definition: The number of complaints registered at the national Equality Body on the grounds of (i) ethnic origin/race and (ii) religion.

Number of complaints= Number of discrimination complaints on the grounds of ethnicity/race registered in year X in country Z

Number of complaints= Number of discrimination complaints on the grounds of religion registered in year X in country Z

Source: Annual National Equality Body statistics

Explanation: This indicator presents the number of ethnic-discrimination complaints reported to the national Equality Body(/ies). Unfortunately there is currently no database with harmonised recordings of complaints. The merging of different existing data sources and different types of complaints complicates the comparability of ethnic/racial discrimination complaints across countries. Therefore, we request users to consult the list with a specific definition provided for each country (see Appendix 3).

Complaints data will be collected for all Equality Bodies applying the following definition:

An allegation of discrimination that is officially registered at a state body and results in formal steps being undertaken by the competent authority

These formal steps can include:

- 1) determining whether there has been a breach of the principle of equal treatment
- 2) bringing forward a case on the basis of the submitted complaint; OR
- 3) systematic forwarding of the complaint to the relevant bodies when the complaint falls outside the scope of the agency's competences

This indicator captures complaints at first instance and therefore excludes appeals.

- **Experiences of discrimination**

Definition:

Experiences of ethnic/racial discrimination =

Number of individuals who experienced an incident of ethnic/racial discrimination

Experiences of religious discrimination =

Number of individuals who experienced an incident of religious discrimination

Source: Special Eurobarometer 393 Wave EB77.4 – Discrimination in the EU in 2012

Explanation:

QC2: In the past 12 months have you personally felt discrimination against or harassed on the basis of 1 or more of the following grounds?

Answer categories: Being over 55 years old, Gender, Ethnic origin, Religious beliefs, Disability Sexual orientation, Being under 30 years old, Gender identity, For another reason, No, Don't know, Total 'yes'.
[MULTIPLE ANSWERS POSSIBLE]

Indicators of integration policy outcomes

Main topic	Indicators	Disaggregations currently possible with available data
8. Labour Market Mobility	Employment rate Employment gap	CoB (Country of Birth): - gender - age - educational attainment
	Over-qualification rate Over-qualification gap (ISCED 5-6)	CoB: - gender - age
	In-work poverty rate In-work poverty gap (ISCED 0-2)	CoB: - gender - age
9. Family Reunion	Non-EU family reunification rate	CoC (Country of Citizenship): -citizenship of sponsor
	Dissimilarity Index	CoC: -citizenship
10. Education	-Share Low achievers mathematics level (PISA) -Low achievers in mathematics gap	CoC/CoB: -1 st generation -2 nd generation
11. Political Participation	Political Participation Political Participation gap	CoB: - educational attainment
12. Permanent residence	Share of Permanent permits	CoC:
	Dissimilarity Index	CoC: -citizenship
13. Access to nationality	Naturalisation rate	former citizenship: - gender
	Dissimilarity Index	former CoC: -age -gender -previous citizenship
14. Discrimination	Access to Justice	Grounds: -Race/Ethnicity -Religion/Beliefs

1. Labour market mobility

- **Employment rates by gender and educational attainment**

Definition: The employment rate is calculated by dividing the number of persons aged 20 to 64 in employment by the total same age population. Employed population consists of those persons who during the reference week did any work for pay or profit for at least one hour, or were not working but had jobs from which they were temporarily absent. This indicator is calculated for settled non-EU foreign-born immigrants, meaning non-EU foreign-born who have lived in the country for 10 years or longer. We calculate employment rates for low-educated (ISCED 0-2) and high-educated (ISCED 5-6) separately. The classification of educational attainment is based on the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED). Low-educated include all individuals who have completed pre-primary (ISCED 0), primary (ISCED 1) or lower secondary education (ISCED 2). All individuals who have completed tertiary education make up the high-educated population (ISCED 5-6).

With this data we also calculate the difference in employment of third country nationals and nationals by gender and educational attainment:

Employment rate low-educated (ISCED 0-2) =

$$\frac{\text{Number of employed low-educated non-EU foreign-born in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total low-educated non-EU foreign-born population in year X in country Z}}$$

Employment rate high-educated (ISCED 5-6) =

$$\frac{\text{Number of employed high-educated non-EU foreign-born in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total high-educated non-EU foreign-born population in year X in country Z}}$$

Employment rate low-educated (ISCED 0-2) males=

$$\frac{\text{Number of employed low-educated non-EU foreign-born males in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total low-educated non-EU foreign-born male population in year X in country Z}}$$

Employment rate high-educated (ISCED 5-6) males=

$$\frac{\text{Number of employed high-educated non-EU foreign-born males in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total high-educated non-EU foreign-born male population in year X in country Z}}$$

Employment rate low-educated (ISCED 0-2) females=

$$\frac{\text{Number of employed low-educated non-EU foreign-born females in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total low-educated non-EU foreign-born female population in year X in country Z}}$$

Employment rate high-educated (ISCED 5-6) females=

$$\frac{\text{Number of employed high-educated non-EU foreign-born females in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total high-educated non-EU foreign-born female population in year X in country Z}}$$

Employment rate gap =

$$\frac{\text{Employment rate non-EU foreign-born}}{\text{Employment rate native-born}}$$

Source: Eurostat- EU Labour Force Survey

Eurostat provides employment rate data disaggregated by

- 1) Employment rates by sex, age and country of birth [lfsa_ergacob]
- 2) sex, age and highest level of education attained [lfsa_ergaed]

Explanation: In line with the International Labour Organisation definition, Eurostat defines persons in “employment” as those who worked for at least one hour for pay or profit or family gain during the

reference week, as well as persons who were not at work during the reference week but had a job or business from which they were temporarily absent. This definition is applicable to employees and self-employed persons. Employment statistics are frequently reported as employment rates to discount the changing size of countries' populations over time and to facilitate comparisons between countries of different sizes. The information presented for employment rates is built on estimates for the number of persons. The indicator is based on annual averages of comparable quarterly data.

Relevance: At the European Council held on 17 June 2010, the Member states' Heads of State and Government endorsed a new EU strategy for jobs and smart, sustainable and inclusive growth, known as the Europe 2020 strategy. Employment rate is one of the headline targets of the strategy. Employment contributes to economic performance, quality of life and social inclusion, making it one of the cornerstones of socioeconomic development. Employment rate is also one of the official EU Integration Indicators. Employment is in fact regarded as "a key part of the integration process" in the Common Basic Principles for Immigration Integration Policy adopted by the Justice and Home Affairs Council in 2004. It must be noted that this indicator only captures the population living in private households therefore omitting persons living in institutional households (halls of residence, medical care establishments, religious institutions, collective workers' accommodation, hostels etc.) and persons carrying out obligatory military service. However, this group represent on average less than 2% of the working age population.

- **Overqualification rate by gender**

Definition: Overqualification rate is calculated as a share of the population (aged 20 to 64) with a high educational level (*i.e.* having completed tertiary education, ISCED 5 or 6), and having low or medium skilled jobs (ISCO occupation levels 4 to 9) among employed persons having attained a high educational level. This indicator is calculated for settled non-EU foreign-born immigrants, meaning non-EU foreign-born who have lived in the country for 10 years or longer.

Overqualification rate Total=

$$\frac{\text{Number of highly educated non-EU foreign-born in low/medium skilled jobs in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total employed highly skilled non-EU foreign-born population in year X in country Z}} - \frac{\text{Overqualification rate native-born}}$$

Source: Eurostat- EU Labour Force Survey.
Eurostat provides overqualification rate data disaggregated by

- 1) groups of country of birth, age groups and sex
- 2) groups of country of citizenship, age groups and sex

Explanation: Overqualification refers to a situation in which the actual level of formal education is higher than that required by the job. In order to determine whether a worker is overqualified, the required schooling for his/her job must be determined as well as his/her highest educational attainment level. Three measures of required education can be found in the literature: "normative", "statistical" and "self-declared". In the "statistical" approach, the distribution of education is calculated for each occupation and employees who depart from the mean by more than some *ad-hoc* value – generally, one standard deviation – are classified as over-qualified. The "normative" approach uses an *a priori* presumed correspondence between education and occupations. Eurostat data takes the so-called normative approach of calculating the overqualification rate. How education and job-level are related is determined by scoring both educational levels and different job types and matching them together. The international comparable ISCO (International Standard Classification of Occupations) and the ISCED (International Standard Classification of Education) are used this. The

overqualification rate is defined as the percentage of those persons in employment with a high educational level (having completed tertiary education, ISCED 5 or 6) who are in low or medium skilled jobs (ISCO occupation levels 4 to 9).

This classification system of overqualification creates international comparability and a clear objective benchmark for overqualification. This measure will allow us to explore the share of highly qualified migrants that are in jobs that fit their qualifications and do the same for natives. It must be noted that this measure does not take into account the transferability of qualifications and diplomas. **Relevance:** Over-qualification rate is one of the official EU indicators of immigrant integration defined in the 2010 Ministerial Conferences in Zaragoza. These indicators are relevant for achieving the goal of the Europe 2020 Strategy and benchmarks.

- **In-work at risk of poverty rate**

Definition: This indicator is defined as the share of employed persons (aged of 20-64) with an equivalised disposable income below the risk-of-poverty threshold, which is set at 60 % of the national median equivalised disposable income (after social transfers). This indicator is calculated for low-educated (ISCED 0-2) settled non-EU foreign-born immigrants, meaning non-EU foreign-born who have lived in the country for 10 years or longer.

$$\text{In-work poverty gap} = \frac{\text{In-work poverty rate low-educated non-EU foreign-born}}{\text{In-work poverty rate low-educated native-born}}$$

Source: Eurostat- EU Statistics on Income and Living Conditions (EU-SILC)

Eurostat provides in-work-at-risk-of-poverty rate data disaggregated by

- Broad group of citizenship (population aged 18 and over) [ilc_iw15]
- Broad group of country of birth (population aged 18 and over) [ilc_iw16]

Explanation: The 'in-work poverty risk' is measured as the rate of poverty risk among individuals who are 'in-work', meaning individuals who were employed for more than half the reference period.

This indicator is calculated for the low-educated population (ISCED 0-2). Under EU-SILC, the attainment levels of individuals are classified according to the 'International Standard Classification of Education' version of 1997. This indicator captures the population who have completed pre-primary, primary and/or lower secondary education. Employment status is measured on the basis of monthly calendars completed by survey respondents. An individual is considered "in work" if he/she has spent more than half of the reference year in that status. This indicator does not measure wealth or poverty, but low income in comparison to other residents in that country.

Relevance: The poverty issue is a milestone in the Europe 2020 Strategy. One of the headline targets is "Reduction of poverty by aiming to lift at least 20 million people out of risk of poverty or social exclusion". The eradication of poverty also remains a major challenge of sustainable development, and the social dimension is one of the pillars of the EU's Sustainable Development Strategy (EU SDS). The need to address in-work poverty is also outlined in the European Commission's "Employment and Social Development in Europe" review for 2013. The "In-work poverty" is a proposed indicator to be considered as an additional indicator to the official list of EU Integration Indicators (ref report) in the area of social inclusion. Labour market integration policy aims to offer immigrants self-sufficiency and better conditions for social integration. This indicator monitors whether employment is a sufficient protection against poverty, especially for those in low-paying, temporary, or part-time jobs. Reducing in-work poverty risk may require different policies from those used to reduce overall at-risk-of-poverty rate.

2. Family reunion

- **Non-EU family reunion rate**

Definition: The number of successful TCN applicants reuniting with non-EU nationals (numerator) as a part of the total TCN resident population (denominator).

Annual family reunion rate = $\frac{\text{Number of permits issued to TCN for family reasons in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total TCN population in year X in country Z}}$

This indicator exclusively captures all first time residence permits issued on the grounds of family reunification joining a non EU citizen.

Source: Eurostat- Migration Statistics

Eurostat provides first residence permits issued for family reasons data disaggregated by

3. Reason, length of validity and citizenship [migr_resfam]
4. Reason, age, sex and citizenship [migr_resfas]

Explanation: The non-EU family reunification rate, as developed by the Migration Policy Group¹, has several strengths. This indicator only includes the immigrant group of our interest (non-EU) instead of all family reunification within a given Member State. Furthermore, this total is then also assessed in respect to the total number non-EU immigration, rather than both EU and non EU immigration. The resulting family reunion rate describes how common or uncommon non-EU family reunion is in a country. With the residence permit data and population data provided by Eurostat we are able to calculate an annual non-EU family reunification rate.

Relevance: The right to family and family life is enshrined in European and international law. EU Family Reunion Directive 2003/86/EC (ref) goes one step further to protect the right to family life by establishing the right to family reunion for non-EU sponsors and their families.

Non-EU family reunion rate analyses whether countries promote the right to family reunion as a means to promote integration. This reflects one key objective behind the EU Directive (Preamble 4 to Directive 2003/86/EC)

- **Dissimilarity Index on Non-EU Family Reunion by citizenship**

Definition: The Dissimilarity Index (Duncan & Duncan, 1955) is a measure of the difference across two mutually exclusive groups which can be interpreted as the percentage of one of the two groups included in the calculation that would have to be reshuffled in order to produce a distribution that matches that of the larger area. In this case we measure the degree of difference between reuniting family members and the total TCN population. The index reflects the degree of selectivity within family reunion with scores ranging from 0.0 (the reuniting family members perfectly reflect the TCN population in terms of citizenship breakdown) to 100.0 (there are large differences between the reuniting family members and the TCN population in terms of citizenship).

The Dissimilarity Index is defined as one-half of the sum of absolute differences in proportions in groups 1 and 2 in the *i*th area. The basic formula for the index of dissimilarity is:

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^N \left| \frac{b_i}{B} - \frac{w_i}{W} \right|$$

¹ The rate presents the number of successful applicants (numerator) as a part of the total non-EU legal resident population (denominator). MPG policy brief (Huddleston 2012)

Where comparing the population that have reunited with a TCN family member in 2012 with the total TCN population in 2012 on the grounds of citizenship

b_i = the total number of individuals with i^{th} citizenship who have immigrated in 2012 on grounds of family reunion

B = the total population who have immigrated in 2012 on grounds of family reunion

w_i = the total number of individuals with i^{th} citizenship within the whole TCN population

W = the total TCN population in country X

Source: Eurostat- Migration Statistics

Eurostat provides first residence permits issued for family reasons data disaggregated by

1. Reason, length of validity and citizenship [migr_resfam]

And population data disaggregated by

2. Population by sex, age group and citizenship [migr_pop1ctz]

Explanation: We adopt this measure to describe the imbalance within family reunion distributions for different groups of citizenship. With a perfectly even distribution, the group of reuniting family members would have the same population proportions as the total TCN population in terms of the percentage of each citizenship group. In a case where certain citizenships are distributed so that they are overrepresented in the total TCN population and underrepresented in the group of reuniting family members (over vice versa), we would find that there is an unevenness across the two groups. It is important to note that the index does not tell you the patterns of citizenship unevenness but the relative degree of unevenness. For example, an index of 50% could mean that half of the citizenship groups are completely proportionately distributed across the two groups and the other half of the citizenship groups are not at all present in one of the two groups, or it could mean that all citizenships are present across the two groups but disproportionately distributed. The only way to truly interpret the index in terms of specific groups of citizenship is to look at the data more closely.

Relevance: The Dissimilarity Index (sometimes known as the displacement/differentiation index) is one of the most commonly used measures of segregation and inequality and has previously been applied in many fields including the analysis of: residential patterns by ethnicity; gendered patterns of occupation; polarised income patterns in family economics, and the social composition of schools in education. Our application of the Dissimilarity Index is unique and novel approach but follows logically from previous work as the results will reflect whether there is a high degree of selectivity within family reunification in different EU Member States allowing us to draw links to policy.

3. Education

- **share of low-achieving 15-year-olds in mathematics by mother's educational attainment**

Definition: The number of 1st generation and 2nd generation immigrants who do not attain mathematics proficiency Level 2. This indicator is calculated separately for students with low-educated mothers. Low-educational attainment is determined by the ISCED classification and includes all mothers who have completed at most pre-primary, primary and/or lower secondary education (levels 0-2).

Low-achieving foreign-born with low educated mothers=

$$\frac{\text{Number of foreign-born (age 15) with low educated mothers (ISCED 0-2) who do not attain maths proficiency Level 2}}{\text{Total foreign-born population (15) with low educated mothers (ISCED 0-2)}}$$

Low-achieving native-born children of immigrants with low educated mothers=

$$\frac{\text{Number of 2nd generation (age 15) with low educated mothers (ISCED 0-2) who do not attain maths proficiency Level 2}}{\text{Total 2nd generation immigrant population (15) with low educated mothers (ISCED 0-2)}}$$

Low-achieving natives with low educated mothers=

$$\frac{\text{Number of natives (age 15) who do not attain maths proficiency Level 2 with low educated mothers (ISCED 0-2)}}{\text{Total native population (15) assessed with low educated mothers (ISCED 0-2)}}$$

$$\text{Low achievers gap} = \frac{\text{Share of TCN Low-achievers with low educated mothers (ISCED 0-2)}}{\text{Share of natives Low-achievers with low educated mothers (ISCED 0-2)}}$$

Source: OECD's Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)

The available data allows us to make a distinction between immigrants, native born children of immigrants and children of native born.

Explanation: The Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) covers students who are aged between 15 years 3 months and 16 years 2 months at the time of assessment and who have completed at least 6 years of formal schooling, regardless of the type of institution in which they are enrolled and of whether they are in full-time or part-time education, of whether they attend academic or vocational programmes, and of whether they attend public or private schools or foreign schools within the country.

PISA scores give objective and comparable measures of educational achievement useful for the study of integration of migrant children across countries and is often used in research (OECD indicator of immigrant integration & Zaragoza integration indicator). This measure does not focus on actual access to different educational levels, instead it focuses on the quality of education which should result in higher achievement.

Relevance: The 'low-achieving 15-year-olds in mathematics' is an established ET2020 benchmark that shows the share of students who do not reach baseline proficiency. One of the strategic objectives for 2020 is to lower the share of low-achieving 15-year olds in reading to less than 15 % by 2020.

4. Political Participation

- **Political Participation Index by educational attainment**

Definition: Share of non-EU foreign-born 18+ who reported taking part in *at least* one of the following activities in the past 12 months: 1) contacted politician, 2) worked in a political party or action group, 3) worked in another organization or association, 4) is a member of political party, 5) signed a petition, 6) taken part in lawful public demonstration. This indicator is calculated for settled non-EU foreign-born immigrants, meaning non-EU foreign-born who have lived in the country for 7 years or longer.

% of non-EU foreign-born who are politically active =

$$\frac{\text{Number of non-EU foreign-born 18+ who were politically active in the last 12 months}}{\text{Total non-EU foreign-born 18+ population}}$$

% of low-educated (ISCED 0-2) non-EU foreign-born who are politically active =

$$\frac{\text{Number of low-educated non-EU foreign-born 18+ who were politically active in the last 12 months}}{\text{Total low-educated non-EU foreign-born 18+ population}}$$

% of high-educated (ISCED 5-6) non-EU foreign-born who are politically active =

$$\frac{\text{Number of high-educated non-EU foreign-born 18+ who were politically active in the last 12 months}}{\text{Total high-educated non-EU foreign-born 18+ population}}$$

$$\text{Political participation Gap} = \frac{\text{\% non-EU foreign-born politically active}}{\text{\% native-born politically active}}$$

Source: European Social Survey

5. Permanent residence

5.1 Outcome indicator 10

- **Share of TCN who acquired Permanent residence permits**

Definition: The share of third country nationals residing in each EU Member State on the grounds of a valid permanent/long-term residence permit

$$\text{Share of LTR permits} = \frac{\text{Number of TCN holding LTR permits in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Source: Eurostat- Migration Statistics

Eurostat provides long-term residence permit data disaggregated by

3. Citizenship on 31 December of each year [migr_reslong]
4. age, sex and citizenship on 31 December of each year [migr_reslas]

For the following countries National data sources were used to calculate the LTR rate: **DE, FR, HR, PL, PT, FI, SE**

Explanation: The numerator used to calculate this indicator is the population of third-country nationals having a long-term/permanent resident status. The denominator is the total number of valid permissions to stay held by third country nationals. It is important to note that these data on long-term residents do not only relate to 'EU long-term resident status' as defined in Council Directive 2003/109/EC9. Long-term permits granted to third-country nationals under equivalent national rules and procedures are also included. Seeing as Denmark, Ireland and the UK are not implementing Directive 2003/109/EC, these countries report statistics only on long-term residents under category National long-term resident status.

Statistics on residence permits are based entirely on administrative sources. Member States compile data in compliance with the Council Regulation (EC) 862/2007 and following guidelines and instructions provided by Eurostat. Due to the recent implementation of the Residence Permits Data Collection, some methodological and administrative differences still exist between the Member States. Some countries are in the process of harmonisation with the definitions, reducing conceptual disparities and changing data availability and completeness status for some categories of data. Due to inconsistencies that we have come across we will have to make corrections using additional Eurostat permit data. For instance, it has been found that some Member States may have classified LTR permit data in the classification "other". Therefore, we will refer Eurostat and to national statistics to determine the correct interpretation of the Eurostat data.

Relevance: The share of third country nationals who acquire permanent residence is one of the proposed relevant EU Indicators of immigrant integration in the area of active citizenship (ref). This indicator reports on the proportion of third country nationals resident in each EU Member State who had long-term/permanent resident status at the end of the calendar year. The resulting indicator describes how common or uncommon it is for non-EU residents to have permanent residence and, by extension, the same socioeconomic rights and responsibilities as nationals (ref).

- **Dissimilarity Index on Permanent Residence by citizenship**

Definition: The Dissimilarity Index (Duncan & Duncan, 1955) is a measure of the difference across two mutually exclusive groups which can be interpreted as the percentage of one of the two groups included in the calculation that would have to be reshuffled in order to produce a distribution that matches that of the larger area. In this case we measure the degree of difference between TCN acquiring long-term residence and the total TCN population. The index reflects the degree of selectivity within long-term residence

acquisition with scores ranging from 0.0 (the TCN holding long-term residence permits perfectly reflect the TCN population in terms of citizenship) to 100.0 (there are large differences between the TCN holding long-term residence permits members and the total TCN population in terms of citizenship).

The Dissimilarity Index is defined as one-half of the sum of absolute differences in proportions in groups 1 and 2 in the i th area. The basic formula for the index of dissimilarity is:

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^N \left| \frac{b_i}{B} - \frac{w_i}{W} \right|$$

Where comparing the TCN population who have acquired a long-term/permanent residence permit with the total TCN population in 2011 on the grounds of citizenship

b_i = the total number of individuals with i^{th} citizenship who hold a long-term residence permit on the 31st of December 2011

B = the total population who hold a long-term residence permit on the 31st of December 2011

w_i = the total number of individuals with i^{th} citizenship within the whole TCN population

W = the total TCN population in country X

Source: Eurostat- Migration Statistics

Eurostat provides data on long-term residents on 31 December of each year disaggregated by

1.citizenship [migr_reslong]

And population data disaggregated by

2.Population by sex, age group and citizenship [migr_pop1ctz]

Explanation: We adopt this measure to describe the imbalance within long-term residence permit acquisition for different groups of citizenship. With a perfectly even distribution, the group of long-term residents would have the same population proportions as the total TCN population in terms of the percentage of each citizenship group. In a case where certain citizenships are distributed so that they are overrepresented in the total TCN population and underrepresented in the group of long-term residents (over vice versa), we would find that there is an unevenness across the two groups. It is important to note that the index does not tell you the patterns of citizenship unevenness but the relative degree of unevenness. For example, an index of 50% could mean that half of the citizenship groups are completely proportionately distributed across the two groups and the other half of the citizenship groups are not at all present in one of the two groups, or it could mean that all citizenships are present across the two groups but disproportionately distributed. The only way to truly interpret the index in terms of specific groups of citizenship is to look at the data more closely.

Relevance: The Dissimilarity Index (sometimes known as the displacement/differentiation index) is one of the most commonly used measures of segregation and inequality and has previously been applied in many fields including the analysis of: residential patterns by ethnicity; gendered patterns of occupation; polarised income patterns in family economics, and the social composition of schools in education. Our application of the Dissimilarity Index is unique and novel approach but follows logically from previous work as the results will reflect whether there is a high degree of selectivity within family reunification in different EU Member States allowing us to draw links to policy.

6. Access to nationality

- **Naturalisation rate by gender**

Definition: The naturalisation rate is defined as the ratio between the number of persons who acquired the citizenship of a country during a calendar year and the stock of TCN residents in the same country at the beginning of the year.

Annual naturalisation rate (total) =

$$\frac{\text{Number of TCN acquiring Member State citizenship in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Annual naturalisation rate (male) =

$$\frac{\text{Number of male TCN acquiring Member State citizenship in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total male TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Annual naturalisation rate (female) =

$$\frac{\text{Number of female TCN acquiring Member State citizenship in year X in country Z}}{\text{Total female TCN population in year X in country Z}}$$

Source: Eurostat- Migration Statistics

Eurostat provides citizenship acquisition data disaggregated by

2. sex, age group and former citizenship [migr_acq]

Explanation: The resulting naturalisation rate is the number of third country residents who acquired citizenship in that year as part of the total number of third country residents. The denominator is the total number of resident third country nationals during the given year and the numerator used is the number of third country nationals who acquired citizenship in that given year. Although Eurostat's data cannot be disaggregated by type of procedure, the data excludes acquisitions of citizenship at birth or from abroad (for non-residents).

The benefits of the naturalisation rate is that it captures the percentage of naturalisations as a share of the non-EU foreign born population, thereby it does not omit individuals who do not attempt to acquire citizenship because they perceive a very low likelihood to be successful. Furthermore, this measure captures the results of recent policies concerning access to nationality and do not capture the effect of a long policy history (like the share of the migrant population that has acquired citizenship). For these reasons naturalisation rate is the best available measure to indicate outcomes of naturalization policies.

Relevance: The share of third country nationals who yearly acquire citizenship has been agreed in the EU Integration Indicators as the relevant outcome measure for naturalisation. This demographic indicator is used in national monitoring systems and research to describe the composition of the immigrant population, the process of political incorporation, and the impact of citizenship policies.

- **Dissimilarity Index on Naturalisation by age, gender and previous citizenship**

Definition: The Dissimilarity Index (Duncan & Duncan, 1955) is a measure of the difference across two mutually exclusive groups which can be interpreted as the percentage of one of the two groups included in the calculation that would have to be reshuffled in order to produce a distribution that matches that of the larger area. In this case we measure the degree of difference naturalised TCN and the total TCN population. The index reflects the degree of selectivity within acquisition of citizenship with scores ranging from 0.0 (the naturalised TCN perfectly reflect the TCN population in terms of age, gender and (former) citizenship) to 100.0 (there are large differences between the naturalised TCN and the total TCN population in terms of age, gender and (former) citizenship).

The Dissimilarity Index is defined as one-half of the sum of absolute differences in proportions in groups 1 and 2 in the i th area. The basic formula for the index of dissimilarity is:

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^N \left| \frac{b_i}{B} - \frac{w_i}{W} \right|$$

Where comparing the TCN population who have acquired Member State citizenship in 2011 with the total TCN population in 2011 on the grounds of age, gender and (former) citizenship

b_i = the total number of males/females with i^{th} citizenship and within i^{th} age-group who have naturalised in 2011

B = the total population who have naturalised in 2012

w_i = the total number of males/females with i^{th} citizenship and within i^{th} age-group within the whole TCN population

W = the total TCN population in country X

Source: Eurostat- Migration Statistics

Eurostat provides data on acquisition of citizenship disaggregated by

1. sex, age group and former citizenship [migr_acq]

And population data disaggregated by

2. Population by sex, age group and citizenship [migr_pop1ctz]

Explanation: We adopt this measure to describe the imbalance within citizenship acquisition between men and women from different groups of citizenship and age-groups. With a perfectly even distribution, the group of naturalised TCN would have the same population proportions as the total TCN population in terms of the percentage of gender, age-group and (former) citizenship. In a case where certain groups are distributed so that they are overrepresented in the total TCN population and underrepresented in the group of naturalised TCN (over vice versa), we would find that there is an unevenness across the two groups. It is important to note that the index does not tell you the patterns of citizenship unevenness but the relative degree of unevenness. The only way to truly interpret the index in terms of specific groups of citizenship is to look at the data more closely.

Relevance: The Dissimilarity Index (sometimes known as the displacement/differentiation index) is one of the most commonly used measures of segregation and inequality and has previously been applied in many fields including the analysis of: residential patterns by ethnicity; gendered patterns of occupation; polarised income patterns in family economics, and the social composition of schools in education. Our application of the Dissimilarity Index is unique and novel approach but follows logically from previous work as the results will reflect whether there is a high degree of selectivity within family reunification in different EU Member States allowing us to draw links to policy.

7. Anti-discrimination

- **Access to justice**

Definition: The share of self-perceived cases of ethnic/racial discrimination that were reported to competent authorities in the reference year

Access to justice= Number of individuals that experienced ethnic/racial discrimination in year X in country Z

Source: Special Eurobarometer (393) 2012 & Annual Equality Body statistics

Explanation: Instead of presenting all this information separately, here a unique indicator is developed which captures all this information at once. The rationale behind this indicator is that in a country with perfect access to justice, each individual that experiences ethnic discrimination should be able to report this in the form of a complaint. In countries where procedures are unclear, individuals perceive filing complaints to be ineffective or too costly, this number will be lower indicating a lower access to justice. With this in mind, an indicator could be calculated by dividing the number of individuals that experience ethnic discrimination in a specific year, by the amount of complaints filed based on ethnic discrimination. The result indicates the number of discriminated individuals per ethnic discrimination complaint, the smaller the number the better the access to justice.

The number of individuals that experienced ethnic discrimination can be calculated using the Eurobarometer, which provides the question “have you been discriminated because of your ethnicity or race in the last 12 months?”. This question provides a percentage of individuals per country that experienced ethnic discrimination in the last 12 months. Subsequently, we have to control for the population size of a country, the number of discriminated individuals is calculated by taking the percentage of ethnic discrimination per country per year of the population size. The denominator is calculated separately, which is the number of ethnic-discrimination complaints reported to a competent body per country. Unfortunately there is currently no database with harmonised recordings of complaints. The merging of different existing data sources and different types of complaints complicates the calculation of a clear solid amount of comparable ethnic discrimination complaints per country.

Complaints data will be collected for all Equality Bodies and Courts applying the following definition:

An allegation of discrimination that is officially registered at a state body and results in formal steps being undertaken by the competent authority

These formal steps can include:

- 1) determining whether there has been a breach of the principle of equal treatment (tribunal + promotional type of agency);
- 2) bringing forward a case on the basis of the submitted complaint (tribunal type of agency); OR
- 3) systematic forwarding of the complaint to the relevant bodies when the complaint falls outside the scope of the agency's competences (tribunal + promotional type of agency).

This indicator captures complaints at first instance and therefore excludes appeals.

Relevance: Governments cannot directly control the levels of ethnic discrimination. What governments *can* do is provide access to justice and effective procedures to remedy the experience of ethnic discrimination. The best integration outcome indicator is therefore one's access to justice and the degree to which victims (can) turn to the law.

Appendix 1.

Overview of Enfranchised Population per Country

Australia	N + owners or rate paying occupiers of property – Victoria and South Australia
Austria	N
Belgium	N + TCN with 5+ years' residence
Bulgaria	N
Canada	N
Cyprus	N
Czech Republic	N
Denmark	N + TCN permanent residents with 3+ years' residence
Estonia	N + TCN residing on the basis of a Permanent residence permit or the right of permanent residence
Finland	N + citizens of Iceland and Norway residing in Finland +TCN with 2+ years' residence
France	N
Germany	N
Greece	N + holders of the Homogenis Identity Card (to which ethnic Greeks of non-Greek nationality are entitled to after having resided in the country for five years) + TCN holding a residence card of indefinite duration residing in the country for at least five years [Repealed in 2013/4]
Hungary	N + TCN with permanent residence permit
Ireland	N + TCN residents
Italy	N
Japan	N + TCN permanent (and possibly permanent) residents (only referenda – some municipalities)
Korea	N + TCN with 3+ years' residence three years after obtaining permanent resident visa
Latvia	N
Lithuania	N + TCN with permanent residence permit
Luxembourg	N + TCN with 5+ years' residence
Malta	N
Netherlands	N + TCN with 5+ years' residence
New Zealand	N + TCN with permanent residence permit
Norway	N + TCN with 3+ years' residence
Poland	N
Portugal	N + Brazilians with 3+ years' residence +Cape Verdeans with 4+ years' residence + reciprocity: Argentina, Chile, Iceland, Norway, Peru, Uruguay and Venezuela with 5+ years' residence
Romania	N
Slovakia	N + TCN with permanent resident permit
Slovenia	N + permanent resident permit
Spain	N + Norwegian with 3+ years' residence +TCN from Bolivia, Cape Verde, Chile, Colombia, Ecuador, Iceland, New Zealand and Paraguay with 5+ years' residence
Sweden	N + Norwegians + Icelandic + TCN with 3+ years' residence
Switzerland	Switzerland – N + TCN in 8 cantons with 5+ years' residence
Turkey	
United Kingdom	N +Commonwealth citizens who hold indefinite leave to remain (ILR) (equivalent to LTR)
United States	N

Note: % non-EU-born who have naturalised = N

Appendix 2.

Residence requirement for ordinary naturalisation

	Duration	Comment
AT	10	10 years of which 5 as permanent resident
AU	4	4 years as permanent resident (automatic at arrival for many)
BE	5	
BG	10	5 years as a permanent resident (normally after 5 years)
CA	4	3 out of 4 years prior to application (means including periods of absence)
HR	8	
CY	7	
CZ	10	5 years of permanent residence OR 10 years of law stay + permanent residence at application
DK	9	
EE	8	
FI	5	
FR	5	
DE	8	
GR	7	
HU	11	8 years of registered residence through national settlement permit (obtained after 3 years)
IS	7	
IE	5	
IT	10	
JP	5	
KR	5	
LV	10	5 years with permanent residence (5+5)
LT	10	
LU	7	
MT	5	
NL	5	
NO	7	
NZ	5	5 years as permanent resident (automatic at arrival for many)
PL	8	3 years as permanent resident (5+3)
PT	6	
RO	8	
SI	10	
SK	10	8 consecutive years immediately prior to the application or 10 years with a permanent permit
ES	10	2 years for countries with historic ties
SE	5	
CH	10	
TU	5	
UK	5	
US	5	5 years as permanent resident (Green Card)

Appendix 3.

Complaints data from national equality bodies

Promotional-type Equality Body:

An Allegation of discrimination that is officially registered at a Promotional-type Equality Body and results in formal advice provided by the Equality Body

AT- Ombud for Equal Treatment (National Equality Body)	promotional - complaints (with follow-up)	"Requests and advice" - Anfragen & Beratung
BE	promotional - complaints	numbers broken down by grounds represent <u>complaints</u> that fall within scope of agency's competences
HR	promotional - complaints	<u>complaints</u> regarding concrete issues/problems related to human rights and antidiscrimination
CZ	promotional - complaints	<u>complaints</u> about unequal treatment
DK - DIHR	promotional - contacts	<u>inquiries</u>
FI - Ombudsman for Minorities	promotional - contacts	<u>Contacts</u> : No info by grounds
FR	promotional - complaints (with follow-up)	RÉCLAMATIONS TRAITÉES PAR L'INSTITUTION EN 2013
DE	promotional - complaints	<u>complaints</u>
EE - Commissioner for Equal Treatment	promotional - complaints	<u>complaints</u> and <u>requests for explanation</u> combined (In 2013 there were 403 applications including 116 about "possible cases of discrimination")
GR - Ombudsman	promotional - complaints	<u>complaints</u> - meaning requests for Ombudsman's intervention received by mail, fax, in person at the GO reception office, or online
GR - Committee for Equal Treatment		
GR - Labour Inspectorate		
IE - Equality Authority	promotional - contacts	reporting <u>queries</u> under the employment equality acts & equal status acts
IT - UNAR	promotional - complaints	<u>complaint</u> - indicates all discrimination cases reported and considered <u>relevant</u> (namely those related to an effective discrimination cases according to the legislation in force)
LV	promotional - complaints (with follow-up)	info per ground only for <u>complaints</u> for which a <u>verification procedure</u> was carried out
LU	promotional - complaints	data on <u>claims of alleged discrimination</u> ("nouveaux cas")
MT	promotional - complaints	<u>complaints</u>
NL: (ADVs.- discrimination bureaus)	promotional - complaints	<u>discrimination complaints</u>
PL	promotional - complaints	NOTE "the term complaint can mean a <u>complaint</u> brought by an individual person, but many of the complaints are in fact identical letter sent to the Ombud by a number of people in order to protest against something.
PT - Commission for Equality and Against Racial Discrimination (CICDR)	promotional - complaints	<u>complaints</u> - racial discrimination complaints
SK	promotional - complaints	<u>complaints</u> alleging the breach of the principle of equal treatment

ES	promotional - complaints (with follow-up)	<u>assisted cases</u>
SE	promotional - complaints	" <u>anmälningar</u> " (notifications)
UK - EHRC		The ECNI and EHRC do not receive complaints and make decisions as such
UK-NI		The ECNI and EHRC do not receive complaints and make decisions as such

Quasi-judicial Equality Body:

An Allegation of discrimination that is officially registered at a quasi-judicial Equality Body and results in a decision being taken by the Equality Body

AT - Equal Treatment Commission		https://www.bmbf.gv.at/frauen/gleichbehandlungskommissionen/bgbk/gutachten_senat_ii.html
BG	quasi-judicial - complaints (with follow-up)	number of <u>case/files</u> initiated on these specific grounds. The Commission doesn't conduct separated statistics concerning the number of complaints received on different protected grounds. The statistics mentioned in the Annual report are related to the number of case/files initiated on different grounds established by law or by an international treaty to which the Republic of Bulgaria is a party, including the grounds of ethnicity, race, religion or belief, exercising the right to work, education.
CY	quasi-judicial - complaints	<u>complaints submitted</u>
DK - Board of Equal Treatment	quasi-judicial - complaints	<u>complaints</u> received by the Board of Equal Treatment including the ones that were dismissed. The complaints do not include regular enquiries, but only proper complaints. If a complaint does not fall within the mandate of the Board, it gets dismissed, but is still counted as a complaint.
EE - Chancellor of Justice	quasi-judicial - complaints	
HU	quasi-judicial - complaints (with follow-up)	statistics show the information about the protected characteristic only in cases where the <u>Authority actually launched an investigation</u>
IE - Equality Tribunal	quasi-judicial - complaints	<u>complaints(/referrals)</u> however, statistical info is grouped cases rather than individual claims.
LT	quasi-judicial - complaints	A total of 262 <u>complaints received</u> , plus 19 possible discrimination cases were opened ex officio
NL	quasi-judicial - complaints	<u>requests for an opinion</u> . NOTE: not all requests for an opinion end in an opinion e.g. not enough evidence, outside the scope of legislation, etc.)
NO	quasi-judicial - complaints	In <u>complaints cases</u> , a complaint is brought against a specific person or company
RO	quasi-judicial - complaints	<u>complaints</u>
SI	quasi-judicial - complaints (with follow-up)	only report break down for <u>RESOLVED complaints</u>